EQUALITY IMPACT ASSESSMENT

December 2013

Introduction

This Equality Impact Assessment (EQIA) has been designed to identify whether, and how, this policy will affect people and to ensure the needs and rights of all individuals affected are considered. It has considered relevant evidence in order to understand the likely effect on protected groups which include:

- identifying any existing inequality
- predicting any potential adverse impact
- informing service improvement particularly for disadvantaged or underrepresented groups
- identifying any appropriate actions to eliminate or minimise any adverse impact and for promoting positive impact

An EQIA process is not just about identifying (and mitigating) negative impacts. It is about proactively looking for opportunities to promote equality.

This Equality Impact Assessment of the new Local Government Pension Scheme (LGPS) (Scotland) 2014 (which will take effect from April 2015) began in March 2013 and has been undertaken by Scottish Government in consultation with representatives from LGPS Employers and Unions.

The public sector equality duty in the Equality Act 2010 came into force in April 2011 – this is often referred to as the general duty. Scottish public authorities must have 'due regard' to the need to eliminate unlawful discrimination, advance equality of opportunity and foster good relations.

Marriage and civil partnership are covered under the general duty in respect of eliminating unlawful discrimination.

The relevant protected characteristics referred to in the second and third elements of the general duty are age, disability, sex, gender reassignment, pregnancy and maternity, race, religion or belief, and sexual orientation.

The Scottish Local Government Pensions Advisory Group (SLOGPAG) are committed to ensuring that future Governance arrangements for the LGPS scheme include the collation of the necessary data from employers including; sexual orientation, gender reassignment, pregnancy and maternity and religion or belief. This information is required to ensure that there is sufficient evidence that these groups are treated equally in the scheme.

Consultation/engagement

The members of SLOGPAG were diverse and they consulted with, and represented the views of, stakeholders. There will be a period of public consultation on the new scheme before the scheme regulations are laid in parliament in April 2014.

EQUALITY IMPACT ASSESSMENT

December 2013

Stated Policy Aims

COSLA

"Scotland's Councils are one of Scotland's largest employers, employing over 280,000 people. Our employees work at the heart of every local community, providing valued and cherished services allowing people to work, live in or visit our communities.

COSLA recognise the essential role played by our employees in delivering these services and realising positive outcomes for people and communities and so we welcome the opportunity to ensure we are providing a fair and sustainable reward package to our employees.

The reform of the LGPS in Scotland, whilst deemed unnecessary by COSLA and the Trade Unions, has provided an opportunity for COSLA to ensure that the scheme design and governance arrangements are sustainable, focused on supporting colleagues at the lower end of the pay-scale and uniquely Scottish in approach."

Trade Unions

"The local government trades unions, UNISON, GMB, Unite and UCATT, regard the reform of the Scottish LGPS as an unnecessary interference by the UK Government in the operation of a pension scheme that had been updated as recently as April 2009.

Our approach has been to minimise the impact of the changes imposed by the UK Government and maintain the main elements of the uniquely Scottish approach. The main aim was to protect and improve pension benefits for the majority of members without increasing contributions. Such an increase would simply drive members away from pension provision at a time of pay cuts and other economic pressure.

We hope the new scheme will attract new members, particularly women and those at the lower end of the pay scale who are most likely to suffer by not having a secure pension in retirement. In doing so we believe we have a sustainable and affordable scheme for the longer term."

Scottish Ministers

The reform of the Local Government Pension Scheme in Scotland is as a result of the overarching UK Public Service Pensions (PSP) Act 2013. Scottish Ministers aim to provide a new scheme, specific to Scottish members, which is affordable, sustainable and fair to employers, scheme members and tax-payers.

EQUALITY IMPACT ASSESSMENT

December 2013

Step One - Define the Aims of the Policy

Title of policy	Local Government Pension Scheme (LGPS) Scotland 2015
Name of Branch or Division	Policy Branch
Directorate or Agency	Scottish Public Pensions Agency
What is the purpose of the proposed policy (or changes to be made to the policy)?	The reform of the Local Government Scheme in Scotland is as a result of the overarching UK PSP Act 2013.
Who is affected by the policy or who is intended to benefit from the proposed policy and how?	 The policy affects: Local Government Employers LGPS Administering Authorities Admitted and Scheduled Body Employers (including 3rd Sector organisations) Scheme members (predominantly LG workforce).
How have you, or will you, put the policy into practice, and who is or will be responsible for delivering it?	 The new LGPS will come into effect on 1 April 2015. To be regulated by the Scottish Ministers. It will continue to be managed by the 11 Administering Authorities, who also manage fund investments.
How does the policy fit into our wider or related policy initiatives?	 The revised LGPS is one of a number of public sector pension schemes to be reformed as a result of the UK Pensions Act. The aim of the Act was to reform public sector pension schemes to ensure that they are affordable and sustainable over the longer term. The new scheme also introduces: A career average revaluation of earnings CARE), which is more equitable for all members than the current final salary scheme, which favours the higher paid. A link between Normal Pension Age (NPA) and State Pension Age (SPA) to encourage members to continue working past age 65 A cost-control arrangement which

EQUALITY IMPACT ASSESSMENT

December 2013

	 ensures that there is a mechanism in place to control the costs of employer contributions. A new Governance structure with oversight of the whole scheme and associated costs. Aspects to ensure the long term viability of the LGPS scheme and pensions benefits which are part of the overall Public Sector reward package. The new scheme incorporates some elements of choice designed to encourage both retention of existing members and new membership.
	In keeping with good practice, the new scheme was developed via a tripartite process under the aegis of SLOGPAG. This group included representatives from employers (including COSLA), trades unions and the Scottish Government.
Do you have a set budget?	Yes – liabilities are met through employer and member contributions. Administration costs met by local authorities.

EQUALITY IMPACT ASSESSMENT

December 2013

Step Two - What do you already know about the diverse needs and/or experiences of your target audience?

Do you have information on	Yes	No
Age	V	
Disability		V
Gender	√	
Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual & Transgender		V
Race	V	
Religion and Belief		

EQUALITY IMPACT ASSESSMENT

December 2013

Evidence

Age

- Current scheme accessible from 16 to 75 years of age.
- A flexible retirement age means it is not compulsory to take pension at NPA. The age at which benefits may be taken (the pension age) is any time between 55 and 75. Benefits will be subject to an actuarial adjustment (up or down) relative to the proximity of the pension age to the NPA, which is to be linked to the SPA or age 65, whichever is later. (Please note that a member seeking to access pension benefits between the ages of 55 and 60 require their employer's permission).
- Retirement age protection to 2020 (Rule of 85 protections) and ill-health transitional protection from the previous scheme retained.
- Transitional arrangements to protect the pensions of those members within 10 years of retirement at 1 April 2012.

Age	LGPS ¹ Membership	LGPS ² Workforce	LGPS Membership as % of Workforce
16-20	2,177	3,791	57.4
21-30	12,074	19,858	60.8
31-40	24,978	34,079	73.3
41-50	51,722	66,492	77.8
51-60	56,717	69,215	81.9
61-65	8,859	14,868	59.6
Totals	156,527	208,303	75.1

- The raising of the NPA to 66, 67 and beyond will cause a
 disproportionate impact on men. A review of life expectancy for
 members of the LGPS in Scotland has shown that the life expectancy
 of men (aged 65 in 2011) is 22.1 years compared to 24.8 for women.
 This amounts to 12% more pension years for women.
- The raising of the NPA to 66, 67 and beyond is required by the UK Government's PSP Act 2013, and will have a greater impact on younger people as they will have a longer working period. If, however, the expected increases in life expectancy are realised, the period of 'pension-in-payment' should equate to that of older members.

¹ Source – Local Authority Pension Fund Administrators

² Source – Local Authority Employers

EQUALITY IMPACT ASSESSMENT

December 2013

Evidence

Disability

- Equal access to current scheme. Based on anecdotal evidence it may be assumed that disabled people are more likely to work part-time and potentially be lower paid. The new 50/50 option allows members to pay ½ the contribution rate in return for ½ the pension benefits. This may encourage lower paid members to join the scheme and assist existing members to remain in the scheme during short-term periods of hardship. This option will be reviewed following the 2017 valuations to ensure that it fulfils the policy intent.
- The flexible retirement options may be beneficial to disabled people and those with care responsibilities (in particular the care of older people).
 This provision allows a member to access pension benefits whilst remaining in employment.

The new scheme also retains career breaks, which allows members to take a break to attend to short or long-term care for family members with disabilities or ill-health.

Gender

Evidence

- CARE with 1/49th accrual and CPI revaluation designed to better
 reflect the essentially short service, low paid, low expectation of
 promotion, membership base. This shift to calculating pension as a
 fraction of pensionable pay in each year rather than using service and
 final pay would redress the current advantage provided by a final salary
 arrangement to members with long service who gain promotion in
 excess of average pay increases, particularly towards the end of their
 careers.
- A CARE scheme will disadvantage those high earners who experience career progression later in their working life (mostly men - women are more likely to work part-time and take career breaks to bring up children). Those with low levels of pay, promotion and length of service due to e.g. childcare/other care responsibilities or/and disability reasons, will benefit from the CARE scheme, making the scheme more equitable over the whole workforce.
- Annual Benefit Statements will ensure that all groups are fully aware of the level of benefits that have been accrued and the ability to purchase additional pension.

EQUALITY IMPACT ASSESSMENT

December 2013

Gender (contd)

- The new scheme will retain a five-tier contribution rate structure. This structure mitigates against the problem, that a fixed contribution rate for all members impacts negatively on low paid, who tend to be women.
- Contributions will be based on the actual pay of those working parttime not the full-time equivalent. This means that the cost of
 contributions is lower and better reflects the part-time salary. 57% of
 females and 12% of males work part-time. Most staff in the scheme
 earn, on average, less than £26,000, so the majority of scheme
 members will not face an increase in contributions, which will benefit all
 protected groups.
- The 50/50 option included in the new scheme is intended to encourage lower paid workers into the scheme and to retain those members during short-term periods of hardship. Lower paid / part-time female workers are expected to benefit from this provision.
- The definition of Pensionable Pay will include additional hours worked up to the standard full-time working week. This will specifically benefit scheme members who work part-time.
- The data table below clearly shows that the overwhelming majority of part-time workers are women. The data for disabled employees is not broken down by part-time / full time status but it is likely that a greater proportion of disabled people work part-time than non-disabled people³.

	<u>Total</u>	Full-time	Part-time	% Part-time
Male	74,100	66,700	7,400	12%
	<u>Total</u>	Full-time	Part-time	% Part-time
Female	136,500	62,300	74,200	57%

8

³ *Scheme membership (GAD data – 2013 based on Fund Actuarial valuation reports as at 31 March 2011)

EQUALITY IMPACT ASSESSMENT

December 2013

Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual & Transgender

Evidence

- Equal access to current scheme.
- Pensions for partners who cohabit and civil partners equal those benefits afforded to married couples.
- The requirement to nominate a cohabitee has been dropped.

Race

Evidence

- Equal access to current scheme.
- Most local authorities did not have data for both scheme membership and the workforce as a whole. Of those that have the following is a breakdown between scheme membership and workforce⁴.

No of L.G. Employees (not W.T.E.)	No of L.G. Employees in LGPS	Race *
99	63	African, African Scottish or African British
21	10	African Other
202	120	Any mixed or multiple ethnic groups
2	1	Arab
142	89	Asian Other
10	6	Bangladeshi, Bangladeshi Scottish or Bangladeshi British
56	30	Black, Black Scottish or Black British
91	72	Chinese, Chinese Scottish or Chinese British
182	108	Indian, Indian Scottish or Indian British
1,682	584	Other
609	362	Other White ethnic group
211	109	Pakistani, Pakistani Scottish, Pakistani British
1,817	1,087	White British
117	79	White Eastern European (for example, Polish)
955	607	White English
4	3	White Gypsy/Traveller
671	471	White Irish
70	28	White Northern Irish
10,756	7,540	White Other
73,210	54,921	White Scottish
75	45	White Welsh
28,222	14,660	Prefer Not To Answer
10,624	6,938	No ethnicity recorded
129,828	87,933	Total

⁴ Data on race was gathered from 18/32 councils

EQUALITY IMPACT ASSESSMENT

December 2013

- Ethnic minority groups have a younger age structure than the rest of the population and the ethnic minority population is growing.⁵
- Some ethnic minority groups are more likely to work part-time and rates are particularly high for women in some groups.
- Research carried out by the Equality and Human Rights
 Commission in 2008 found that employees from ethnic minority
 groups have lower earnings than white people at most ages.
- Minority ethnic groups have low income in later life from private (occupational or personal) pensions, partly due to shorter employment records in Britain since migration. They may also be more likely to opt out of pension provision, due to higher rates of inwork poverty, low levels of financial capability, and lower levels of familiarity with the English language and pensions terminology⁶

Religion and Belief

Evidence

- Equal access to current scheme.
- Possible to have personal pension scheme alongside, or instead of, membership of LGPS. This provides an alternative for individuals whose beliefs do not support investment for profit⁷.

No of L.G. Employees (Not FTE)	No of L.G. Employees in LGPS	Religion and Belief *
723	519	Another Religion
71	39	Buddhist
		Church of
10,198	6,759	Scotland
19	9	Hindu
30	19	Humanist
7	5	Jewish
79	48	Muslim
8,122	5,584	None
2,773	1,714	Other Christian
21	13	Pagan
2,338	1,516	Roman Catholic

⁵ Scottish Census (2011)

_

⁶ EHRC (2008): The under pensioned: disabled people and people from ethnic minorities.

⁷ Data on religion/belief was gathered from 10/32 councils. Many councils do not have a robust evidence base on which to report religion and belief, this accounts for the low number of respondents.

EQUALITY IMPACT ASSESSMENT

December 2013

No of L.G. Employees (Not FTE)	No of L.G. Employees in LGPS	Religion and Belief *
16	9	Sikh
		Prefer not to
21,853	13,955	answer
		No information
26,637	19,486	held
72,887	49,675	Total
	•	1

EQUALITY IMPACT ASSESSMENT

December 2013

Step Three - Do you have enough information to help you understand the diverse needs and/or experiences of your target audience?

If not, what else do you need to know?

Age	Do you have enough information to proceed?	YES
Disability	Do you have enough information to proceed?	YES
Gender	Do you have enough information to proceed?	YES
Lesbian, gay, bisexual and transgender	Do you have enough information to proceed?	YES
tianogoriao.		
Race	Do you have enough information to proceed?	YES
Religion and Belief	Do you have enough information to proceed?	YES

EQUALITY IMPACT ASSESSMENT

December 2013

Step Four - What does the information you have tell you about how this policy might impact positively or negatively on the different groups within the target audience?

Age	Equal access to the pension scheme;
	retain retirement flexibilities which encourage continued participation in the workplace by older staff.
Disability	equal access to the pension scheme;
	retain ill-health benefits & death in Service gratuity
Gender	equal access to the pension scheme;
	 retaining tiered contribution rates on a banded basis increases the rates of the higher earners (disproportionately male) while reducing the contributions of the lower paid workers (disproportionately female) This helps to equalise the contributions to benefits ratio.
Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual &	equal access to the pension scheme;
Transgender	equal rights for civil and same sex partners as for married couples
Race	equal access to the pension scheme;
	The provision of simplified annual benefits statements which will show exactly what the member has accrued each year, contributions based on actual pay of those working part-time, the 50/50 option and the inclusion of additional hours worked up to the standard full-time working week; all of these changes will specifically benefit the lower paid scheme members who work part-time.
Religion and Belief	equal access to the pension scheme;
	no issues identified with religion and belief

EQUALITY IMPACT ASSESSMENT

December 2013

Step Five - Will you be making any changes to your policy?

i) Change - Career average revaluation of earnings (CARE) revalued annually using the Consumer price index (CPI) to revalue the accrued pension.

Purpose – This change replaces the final salary pension scheme and is designed to redress the balance for members who are typically low paid, with short service and low expectation of promotion due to e.g. childcare/other care responsibilities or/race or disability.

This may disadvantage high earners, particularly those who experience career progression later in their careers, which tend to be men.

Is there any Impact?	Yes	No
Age		
Disability	V	
Gender	V	
Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual & Transgender		$\sqrt{}$
Race	V	
Religion and Belief		

ii) Change - Pensionable pay to include additional hours

Purpose - This change seeks to better reflect the importance of counting each year's pensionable pay in a CARE scheme rather than the requirement for Final Pay (last year) in a Final Salary Scheme. It clarifies that part time members should have all additional hours counted as pensionable.

Is there any Impact?	Yes	No
Age		
Disability	V	
Gender	V	
Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual & Transgender		V
Race	V	
Religion and Belief		1

iii) Change – Introduction of a 50/50 option

Purpose – This change is designed to provide a short-term alternative to those members who may be considering opting out of the scheme for financial reasons, as well as encouraging non-members, who are mainly low paid women, to save for their retirement. It is not envisaged to be a long-term alternative to full membership.

EQUALITY IMPACT ASSESSMENT

December 2013

Is there any Impact?	Yes	No
Age		
Disability	V	
Gender	√	
Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual & Transgender		
Race	V	
Religion and Belief		V

iv) Change - Normal Pension Age to equal State Pension Age

Purpose – This change is a mandatory requirement in the Public Service Pensions Act 2013. Members will retain the option to retire and access their pension from the age of 55 with an actuarial reduction (employers consent required between the age of 55 and 60), or to work beyond their Normal Pension Age with cost-neutral uplift factors for benefits accrued beyond Normal Pension Age. Due to their typically younger demographic, those from ethnic minorities may have to work for longer before they are entitled to receive their pension.

There may be a disproportionate impact on men as their average life expectancy is 4 years less than women (according to ONS), and therefore they may be in receipt of their pension for a lesser period.

Is there any Impact?	Yes	No
Age		
Disability		V
Gender	V	
Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual & Transgender		V
Race	\ \ \	
Religion and Belief		V

EQUALITY IMPACT ASSESSMENT

December 2013

Step Six - Does your policy provide the opportunity to promote equality of opportunity or good relations by altering the policy or working with others?

Age	Yes		No	
Disability	Yes		No	
Gender	Yes	√	No	
Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual & Transgender	Yes		No	√
Race	Yes	√	No	
Religion and Belief	Yes		No	$\sqrt{}$

Age	Transitional protection will encourage continued participation in the workplace by older staff.
Disability	No issues
Gender	Contributions based on actual part-time pay, the 50/50 option and the inclusion of additional hours for pension purposes will specifically benefit lower paid and part-time members
Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual & Transgender	Civil and same-sex partners have the same dependent's rights as married couples. The requirement to nominate a cohabitee has been dropped.
Race	Simplified annual benefits statements, contributions based on actual part-time pay, the 50/50 option and the inclusion of additional hours for pension purposes will specifically benefit the typically lower paid ethnic minority members.
Religion and Belief	No issues

EQUALITY IMPACT ASSESSMENT

December 2013

Step Seven - Based on the work you have done - rate the level of relevance of your policy

Tick one box for each strand

	Age	Disability	Gender		Religion and belief	Race
Medium						
Low						
Unknown No evidence or date has been collected therefore an assessment cannot be made		√*		√ *	V	

^{*} Although no statistical evidence in terms of disability and LGBT exists, it is anticipated that the 50/50 option will be of relevance to those with disabilities, and the nomination of a cohabitee no longer being required will be of relevance to the LGBT group.

EQUALITY IMPACT ASSESSMENT

December 2013

Step Eight - Is a further impact assessment required?

Age	Yes	No √
Disability	Yes	No √
Gender	Yes	No √
Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual & Transgender	Yes	No √
Race	Yes	No √
Religion and Belief	Yes	No √

If you have answered yes please explain why	

EQUALITY IMPACT ASSESSMENT

December 2013

Step Nine - Please explain how you will monitor and evaluate this policy/function or strategy to measure progress?

Please explain how monitoring will be undertaken, when it will take place and who is responsible for undertaking it.

A Scheme Advisory Board will be established to take the place of the current tripartite SLOGPAG, which, as part of its remit, will continue to monitor equality issues as the new scheme is implemented.

EQUALITY IMPACT ASSESSMENT

December 2013

Sign off and Authorisation

Impact Assessment Steps 1-9	Yes	No
1. Defined the aims of your policy	V	
2. Identified what we already know (i.e. what does the existing evidence base tell us?)	1	
3. Identified what more we need to know (i.e. what gaps have we identified in our evidence base?)	1	
4. Analysed the evidence (i.e. what does this all mean in relation to our policies?)	1	
5. Considered any necessary changes & identified action (i.e. will you be taking action to make any changes? If yes, what, when and who? If not, what are your reasons for not taking any action?)	V	
6. Identified opportunities to promote equality	V	
7. Measured differential impact	V	
8. Assessed whether further impact assessment work is needed	1	
9. Outlined arrangements for monitoring & evaluation	V	

.

EQUALITY IMPACT ASSESSMENT

December 2013

Policy Title	Local Government Pension
	Scheme (LGPS) Scotland 2015
Name of Branch or Division	Policy Branch
Directorate or Agency	Scottish Public Pensions Agency
We have completed the equality	Name: Kimberly Linge
impact assessment for this policy.	
	Position: Local Government
Line	Pension Policy Manager
	-
	Date: 23 December 2013
Directorate authorisation	Name: Chad Dawtry
	Position: Director of Policy,
lot. e	Strategy and Development
V	Date: 23 December 2013
	שמום. בט שבטכווושבו בט וט

On completion, an Equality Impact Assessment Results document will be published on the Scottish Public Pensions Agency website.